GUIDELINES FOR APPEALS PROCESS FOR LEARNER ASSESSMENTS

Overview

The Department of Anesthesiology and Pain Medicine uses a formal appeals process for hearing concerns of teachers about their own evaluations. Teachers who wish to appeal will follow the instructions below to submit a formal written request and rationale with support from their respective Department Site Chief to Dr. Mark Levine, Director of Evaluation Appeals. The Appeals Review Committee convenes and adjudicates annually regarding submitted appeal requests. Teachers are notified of the outcome of the investigation and appeals review. It is important to note, under no circumstances should faculty attempt to contact learners who they believe may have provided a teaching evaluation that they wish to challenge. Appeals of scores will be handled exclusively through the appeals committee.

The guideline below outlines the process for the appeal and the responsibilities of the appellant and general set of guidelines for adjudication, and the reporting process.

Membership:

The Appeals Review Committee comprises of the Director of Evaluation Appeals and two anesthesia residents.

Procedure to File an Appeal:

1. All appeal requests are to be submitted to the online portal for review. The request for an appeal must be submitted by the deadline stated on the website to ensure applications are forwarded to the Appeals Review Committee.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Submission Date</th>
<th>Meeting Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Annually third week of December</td>
<td>Annually third week of February</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Application for an appeal request is applicable only to the report preceding the current academic year. For example, 2019-20 assessment reports are released for review, you can submit an appeal for the February 2021 meeting.

3. All formal written request must provide a rationale and the endorsement and co-signature of the Anesthesiologist-in-Chief from their respective hospital site.
**Process & Reporting:**

1. The appeals requests will be compiled by the Department Academic Coordinator for review by the Appeal Review Committee.

2. The results of the appeals reviews will be reported to the Vice-Chair of Education and Department Chair, where the final review takes place.

3. In the case of appeals being upheld, the challenged or questionable evaluations are suspended within the POWER or ELANTRA system, effectively correcting the affected teachers’ summary reports. These amendments are usually completed within eight weeks following rulings from the Appeals Review Committee.

4. In the case of appeal requests being denied, appellants will also be duly informed about the outcome. However, an additional notice of the unsuccessful appeal will be remitted for inclusion in the teacher’s faculty file.

5. Cases evidencing consistent allegations of significantly poor performance are referred to the Vice-Chair of Education, Department of Anesthesiology and Pain Medicine.

6. All outcomes are considered final and are reported to the appellant as either supported or denied. Appellants’ respective Anesthesiologist-in-Chief are copied on the reports.

**Standards & Guiding Principles:**

In order to ensure uniformity and fairness, the Committee relies on standards in the adjudication process that may include:

1. Face validity:
   a. A presentation of reasonably refuting evidence.
   b. Undue influence of a statistically atypical evaluation(s).
   c. Obvious transposition of scale ratings.

2. For evaluations in question, additional considerations may include:
   a. Whether there is apparent retribution by a trainee.
   b. Whether or not a trainee(s) has (have) substantiated their ratings in narrative form. Face-validity.
   c. Whether the degree of contact between Teacher and Trainee is reasonable for purposes of rendering an evaluation of Teaching Effectiveness.

3. In circumstances where arguments for and against upholding an appeal are balanced, the resolution will favour the appellant.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Approver</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Ahtsham Niazi</td>
<td>Approved</td>
<td>November 20, 2020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>